Effect of Customer Relationship Management on Organisational Resilience of Deposit Money Banks in Nigeria

Friday Ogbu Edeh, Chukwu Agnes Ugboego, Osueke Nelson Chibuike

ABSTRACT

This study investigates the effect of customer relationship management on organisational resilience of deposit money banks in Nigeria using cross-sectional research survey. Simple random sampling was used to select ten deposit money banks in Abakaliki, Ebonyi State. Eighty senior managers were sampled from ten deposit money banks in Abakaliki. Sample size of sixty six was ascertained from the accessible population with Krejcie and Morgan. Closed ended questionnaire was used to collect data from the respondents. Face validity approach was employed to ascertain the validity of the instrument. Cronbach α was used to determined the reliability of instrument. Frequency distribution was used to analyse participants' demographic characteristics while simple linear regression was used to analyse the hypotheses with IBM SPSS Statistics (20.0). The study found that customer relationship management has positive significant effect on organisational resilience of deposit money banks in Nigeria. The study concludes that customer relationship management measured in terms of people, process and technology dimensions promotes organisational resilience measured on openness, proaction and authenticity in the service oriented organizations. It was recommended that managers of deposit money banks in Nigeria and sub-Saharan Africa should embrace customer relationship management that is geared towards employee collaboration, quality service delivery, customer satisfaction and customer information management.

Keywords: Customer relationship management, Organizational resilience, People, Process, Technology, Authenticity, Proaction, Openness, Resilient.

JEL Classification: M10, H12, L80.

DOI: 10.20448/802.62.272-284


Copyright: This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 License.

Funding: This study received no specific financial support.

Competing Interests: The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

History: Received: 7 June 2019/ Revised: 17 July 2019/ Accepted: 23 August 2019/ Published: 9 October 2019

Publisher: Online Science Publishing
1. INTRODUCTION

The turbulence circumstances surrounding businesses in the sub-Saharan Africa has adversely affected their smooth operations especially the deposit money banks which serve as treasury handbag for the society. Mergers, acquisitions, recapitalizations and staff lay-off that have characterized most deposit money banks in Nigeria are evident (Edeh, 2019). These vulnerabilities occur as a result of political instability, economic recession, physical and electronics financial crimes, human capital flight, natural disasters, insecurity such as insurgency, militancy (Edeh and Ukpe, 2019). It is as a result of these turbulences that firms especially deposit money banks are becoming resilient in terms of continuous human resource development and upgrades of financial transaction interface softwares to avoid electronic bank hackers. Resilient organizations are proactive, sensitive, and ever ready to avert negative influences that will hinder their performance and protect shareholders’ wealth (Doe, 1994; Carvalho et al., 2016; Kerr, 2016; Linnenluecke, 2017). Resilient organizations also possess structures that will overcome both internal and external forces that may hinder them from rendering services to their clients through resourcefulness and agility (Sheffi, 2007; Lampel et al., 2014; Sawalha, 2015; Duchek, 2019). It has been shown that organisational resilience is the key to anticipate, adapt and recover from shocks (Javier and Steve, 2008).

Supporting the above argument, Frow and Payne (2009) opined that organizations that are conscious of customer’s needs usually do so as a result of their resilience nature. Thus, relationship coexistence amongst customers and service providers predict enterprise performance, workers commitment, customer retention and corporate image with the host community (Edeh and Onyemauche, 2018). Customers’ are usually regarded as potential personalities and kings in every business as they determine the survivability of every living organisation in the world. It therefore implies that since customers determine the existence of every enterprise, it behooves on management of enterprise to put strategies in place to keep them. This is where customer relationship management is needed to be part of organisational strategic intent to enable managers and their subordinates keep abreast of customers relevant to their survival. Service organizations such as deposit money banks are sustained majorly by customers’ deposits and other precious valuables that the financial institutions derives interest for maintenance and payment of staff salaries. In order to retain these potential sustainers, firms especially deposit money banks must embrace customer relationship management approach. In line with the above argument, Catalán-Matamoros (2012) contended that customer relationship management encourages firms to develop a robust targeting and enquiry management processes and this help boost new businesses significantly. Customer relationship management also enhances customer retention, customer loyalty (Yim et al., 2004; Catalán-Matamoros, 2012; Wang and Feng, 2012; Wu and Lu, 2012). Donaldson and O’Toole (2002) accentuated that customer relationship management increases the profitability of service firms and helps them to identify customer needs in order to tailor products required by the customer.

Drawing from above, previous studies on customer relationship management (Mahsa et al., 2013; Osunde, 2014; Saima et al., 2014; Ighoroje and Oshiobugie, 2015; Tarek, 2016; Rahimi, 2017; Ayo-Oyebiyi et al., 2019) failed to investigate the predictability of customer relationship management to enterprise resilience. Most of these studies were carried out in other countries which are different from the Nigerian work environment. This has created a
lacuna which this study intends to fill by investigating the effect of customer relationship management on organisational resilience of deposit money banks in Nigeria.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Customer Relationship Management

Customer relationship management is a strategy used by firms to cement their relations with customers as well as cost reduction, improve productivity and profitability (Management Study Guide, 2019). Buttle (2009) viewed it as the core business strategy that integrates internal processes and functions, and external networks, to create and deliver value to targeted customers at a profit. Dohnal (2002) viewed customer relationship management as a process of identifying, establishing, maintaining, improving, and if necessary timely termination of economic relations with customers and other concerned subjects for the mutual benefit of all involved parties, which is achieved by mutual fulfilling of obligations and values. Peelen (2005) argued that customer relationship management is a business strategy that is aimed towards developing long-term, mutually profitable, individual customer-supplier relationships and is placed on an information technology infrastructure to be developed, one that enables well-defined and controlled processes, and places capable personnel in a position to function optimally.

Customer relationship management is being described as a strategic method which is concerned with creating enhanced shareholder value via the evolvement of suitable alignments with key customers and customer segments (Payne and Frow, 2005). Customer relationship management is defined by Parvatiyar and Sheth (2001) as a philosophy, a comprehensive strategy which describes the process of acquiring, retaining and partnering with selective consumers to create superior value for both the business and the consumer. Customer relationship management is a systemic managerial process for creating, maintaining, and developing relationships with customers in every position in order to maximize relationship value (Richards and Jones, 2008). Richards and Jones (2008) asserted that Customer relationship management is a set of business activities supported by the alignment of both technology and process directed by strategy and designed to enhance firm performance in an area of customer management. Levine (2000) stated customer relationship management is the utilization of customer related information or knowledge to deliver relevant products or services to customers. Rigby et al. (2002) posited that customer relationship management is a constant process including creation and application of market intelligence knowledge in order to create and maintain customer relationship portfolio which has the highest output.

There are three dimensions of customer relationship management; people dimension, process dimension and technology dimension (Rapp, 2000; Ryals and Knox, 2001; McNally and Griffin, 2007; Asieh et al., 2016; Rahimi, 2017). People dimensions focus on firm readiness to collaborate with their employees in terms of motivation and rewards (Rahimi, 2017). For instance, when managers involve their employees in change implementation, strategy implementation; the employees will go extra mile to advertise the organisation to the society where they reside with customers (Bergeron, 2001; Dyche, 2001; Kumar, 2008). With the above behaviour from the employees; the relationship with customers and the organisation becomes cordial and harmonious thereby increasing the profit margin of the firm.

The process dimension focuses on customer services, satisfaction and demands (Kumar, 2008; Rahimi, 2017). Dyche (2001) contended that no matter how good a firm is; if their focus is shifted from the customer; such firm will not stay long in the industry. Thus, this implies that quality service delivery to customers should be paramount in any business whether service-oriented or production oriented. The third dimension which is technology focuses on customers’ information such as giving them useful information on new products and services through short message service and electronic mail (Asieh et al., 2016). Hong-kit Yim et al. (2004) contended that customer
relationship management that is geared towards technology assists firms and their employees to collect, analyze and distribute quality information to their customers.

Several researchers have investigated customer relationship management around the world in different industries. Ayo-Oyebiyi et al. (2019) examined customer relationship management dimensions and Nigerian banks’ performance. Their finding revealed that customer relationship management dimensions (customer involvement, long-term relationship with customers, joint problem solving and information sharing) jointly and independently influence bank performance measured by customer satisfaction, deposit mobilization and profit level. Osunde (2014) investigated customer relationship management practices in selected deposit money banks in Nigeria. Osunde’s result show that there a significant relationship between consumers cultural perceptions and attitudes towards CRM practices of commercial banks in Nigeria. Ighoroje and Oshiobugie (2015) investigated banker-customer relationship in Nigeria deposit money banks. Their result shows that the emergence of electronic banking has significant and positive impact on the banker-customer relationship in Nigeria. Elijah and Abdullahi (2012) examined the imperatives of customer relationship management in Nigeria deposit money banks. Their result shows that there is a direct relationship between customer relationship management and customer loyalty as well as banks profitability.

Saima et al. (2014) investigated the impact of customer relationship management on customer retention in the telecom industry of Pakistan. Result of their study indicates that customer relationship management has significant impact on customer retention. Mahsa et al. (2013) investigated the effects of customer relationship management on the marketing performance. Result of their study revealed that concentration on the key accounts, technology-based customer relationship management, knowledge management have significant positive effects on the marketing performance. Tarek (2016) examined customer relationship management implementation in Islamic banks in Egypt using cross-sectional survey. Result show that showed that customer relationship management implementation has a significant impact on bank’s customer-based profit performance in the banks. Peyman et al. (2011) investigated the relationship between different dimensions of customer relationship management and innovation capabilities in Melli Bank of Iran. Result of their study show there is significant relationship between information sharing, customer involvement, long-term partnership, joint problem solving, technology-based and innovation capabilities in Melli bank of Iran. Rahimi (2017) investigated the impact of four organisational cultural traits of adaptability, consistency, involvement and mission on the three components of customer relationship management (people, process and technology) in the hotel industry. Result of Rahimi’s study revealed that adaptability, consistency, involvement and mission have positive and significant impacts on people, process and technology. Manal (2014) investigated the impact of CRM capability dimensions on organizational performance. Manal’s finding revealed that customer relationship management organization emerged as the only significant predictor of performance.

### 2.2. Organisational Resilience

Williams et al. (2017) opined that resilience is the organization’s capability to predict major future events from gradually unfolding trends, constantly adapting to change, and rapidly bouncing back from disaster. Kendra and Wachtendorf (2003) perceived resilience as to withstand against shocks without showing any disintegration. (Burnard and Bhamra, 2011; Hilton et al., 2012) considers resilience as an emergent property that the organization exhibits when it encounters setbacks. Other authors consider resilience as a process to recover from a disruption (Van Breda, 2016). In summary, resilience is a function of an organization’s overall situation awareness, management of keystone vulnerabilities, and adaptive capacity in a complex, dynamic, and interconnected environment (McManus et al., 2008). Persistence, stability and adaptive capacity (Timmerman, 1891; Carpenter et
has been defined as "the maintenance of vulnerabilities; while Erol et al. (2008) pointed enterprise flexibility, adaptability, agility and efficiency. For Gunasekaran et al. (2011) the measures of organisational resilience includes adaptability, responsiveness, sustainability and competitiveness. Having reviewed various measure of organisational resilience, this study will adapt three predictors drawn from Flach (1988); Weick (1993) and Mallak (1998) and put forward by Fukofuka et al. (2017) includes; openness, trust, proaction and authenticity albeit, only three will be used in this research work. Openness here refers to when organization reflects the employees' willingness to voice their ideas and their organizations supports them in doing so (Lather et al., 2010). It has been shown that when organisation is open for idea contributions from their employees, it will improve communication and feedback (Choudry, 2011). The second predictor of organisational resilience is trust which refers to when employees "accept what another person says at face value and not search for ulterior motives (Solke, 2013). In addition (Subrahmanian, 2012) contended that trust is extended by to include confidentiality in the sharing and use of information. The third predictor of organisational resilience is proaction which refers to the ability of employees to take initiative, preplan, and take preventive action (Subrahmanian, 2012). Lather et al. (2010) added that employees anticipate issues that may arise and act accordingly to the needs of the future. Lastly, authenticity refers to being original about one's feelings, able to speak out on what one does (Fukofuka et al., 2017). Authenticity is noticeable especially where employees accept one another the way they ware and relate with each other without pretending (Lather et al., 2010).

Previous studies on organisational resilience revealed that it was predicted by other organisational variables. Umoh et al. (2014) examined the effect of management development on organizational resilience in the Nigerian manufacturing industry. Their finding shows that management development is significantly related to organizational resilience. Jaja and Amah (2014) examined the effect of mentoring on organizational resilience in the Nigerian manufacturing industry. Result of their study revealed that mentoring is significantly associated with organizational resilience. From the extant literature above, a conceptual framework showing how the dependent and independent relate with their dimensions and measures was developed and shown in Figure 1.
Based on the conceptual above, the following research hypotheses were formulated.

**H1:** People has no significant effect on openness in deposit money banks in Nigeria.

**H2:** Process has no significant effect on proaction in deposit money banks in Nigeria.

**H3:** Technology has no significant effect on authenticity in deposit money banks in Nigeria.

### 3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Cross-sectional survey was employed as it is concerned with research design where the researcher collect data once over a period of days or weeks or months, in order to answer research questions associated with the study (Saunders et al., 2009). Accessible population for the study comprises of ten selected deposit money banks in Abakaliki, Ebonyi State.

#### 3.1. Population and Sampling

Simple random sampling was employed to select ten deposit money banks in Abakaliki, Ebonyi State. Accessible population of eighty (80) bank customer relationship managers, operations managers, marketing managers and supervisors were sampled from ten deposit money banks in Abakaliki. Sample size of sixty six (66) was ascertained from the accessible population with Krejcie and Morgan (1970) sample size determination table.

#### 3.2. Method of Data Collection

Closed ended structured questionnaire was used to collect data from the respondents. Sixty six copies of questionnaire were administered to respondents. Out of sixty six copies administered, fifty two copies were retrieved, correctly filled and found useful for analysis.

#### 3.3. Measures

Dimensions of customer relationship management (process, people, technology) and measures of organisational resilience (openness, proaction, authenticity) were measured with 4-items each on five point Likert scales ranging.
from 5=Strongly agree; 4=Agree; 3=Disagree; 2=Strongly disagree; 1=Neither agree nor disagree. Face validity was used to ascertain the validity of the instrument, while Cronbach $\alpha$ was used to ascertain the reliability of the instrument and the results shows that process (0.76); people (0.73); technology (0.81) while openness (0.72); proaction (0.75); and authenticity (0.87). Nunnally and Bernstein (1994) affirmed that the benchmark for instrument reliability is between 0.7 and 0.8 coefficients.

3.4. Method of Data Analysis

Participants’ demographic profiles were analysed using descriptive statistics (frequencies). Simple linear regression was used to analyse the hypotheses with IBM SPSS Statistics (20.0).

4. RESULTS

Table 1. Demographic characteristics of respondents.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>65.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>34.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age brackets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20–35 years</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36–45 years</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>32.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 years &amp; above</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>57.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational background</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>19.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor degree</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>51.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master degree</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>21.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field survey (2019).

Table 1 shows the demographic characteristics of respondents in deposit money banks, Abakaliki, Ebonyi State. 34 respondents representing 65.4% are males; 18 respondents representing 34.6% are females. 5 respondents representing 9.6% falls between 20-30 years; 17 respondents representing 32.7% were between 36-45 years; 30 respondents representing 57.7% were between 46 years and above. 10 respondents representing 19.2% hold diploma certificates; 27 respondents representing 51.9% hold bachelor degrees; 11 respondents representing 21.2% hold master degrees; and 4 respondents representing 7.7% hold other educational certificates not included in this study.

Table 2. Regression analysis between people and openness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model summary</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R square</th>
<th>Adjusted R square</th>
<th>Std. error of the estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.471</td>
<td>.221</td>
<td>.206</td>
<td>1.25357</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), People.

ANOVA:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>22.351</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22.351</td>
<td>14.224</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>78.572</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1.571</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100.923</td>
<td>51</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent variable: Openness.
b. Predictors: (Constant), people.
Table 2 shows the result of simple linear regression analysis between people and openness. F-ratio in the ANOVA table indicate that the independent variable is statistically significant and predicted the dependent variable, F(1,50) = 4.03, p<0.05, R² =.221 and with a moderate degree of correlation (R=.471a). The value of F calculated is greater than the tabulated (14.224> 4.03). Based on this, the null hypothesis is rejected and alternate hypothesis accepted. The study therefore found that people has a positive significant effect on openness.

Table 3 shows the result of simple linear regression analysis between process and proaction. F-ratio in the ANOVA table indicate that the independent variable is statistically significant and predicted the dependent variable, F(1,50) = 4.03, p<0.05, R² =.239 and with a moderate degree of correlation (R=.489a). The value of F calculated is greater than the tabulated (15.703> 4.03). In line with this result, the null hypothesis is rejected and alternate hypothesis accepted. This study therefore found that process has a positive significant effect on proaction.
Table 4 shows the result of simple linear regression analysis between technology and authenticity. F-ratio in the ANOVA table indicate that the independent variable is statistically significant and predicted the dependent variable, F(1,50) = 4.03, p<0.05, R² =.220 and with a moderate degree of correlation (R=.469a). The value of F calculated is greater than the tabulated (16.115> 4.03). Based on this result, the null hypothesis is rejected and alternate hypothesis accepted. The study therefore found that technology has a positive significant effect on authenticity.

5. DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

From the above results, this study found that customer relationship management has positive significant effect on organisational resilience of deposit money banks in Nigeria. This is in consonant with Peyman et al. (2011) result which indicated that information sharing, customer involvement, long-term partnership, joint problem solving, technology-based has significant relationship with innovation capabilities in Melli bank of Iran. Specifically, it was found that people dimension of customer relationship management has positive significant effect on openness measure of organisational resilience. This is in line with Ighoroje and Oshiobugie (2015) finding which revealed that the emergence of electronic banking has significant and positive impact on the banker-customer relationship in Nigeria. Secondly, the process dimensions of customer relationship management has positive significant effect on proaction indicators of organisational resilience; and lastly, technology based dimension of customer relationship management has positive significant effect on authenticity measure of organisational resilience.

6. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Based on the findings above, this study concludes that customer relationship management measured in terms of people, process and technology dimensions promotes organisational resilience measured on openness, proaction and authenticity in the service orientated organisations. It has been found also that in order for deposit money banks to maintain resilient culture, they must be proactive, allow employees to make suggestions on how to solve turbulences and also encourage employees to speak out without fear of the unknown. This study recommends that managers of deposit money banks in Nigeria and sub-Saharan Africa should embrace customer relationship management that is geared towards employee collaboration, quality service delivery, customer satisfaction and customer information management.

REFERENCES


*Online Science Publishing* is not responsible or answerable for any loss, damage or liability, etc. caused in relation to/arising out of the use of the content. Any queries should be directed to the corresponding author of the article.